### BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

### MEETING OF THE PLANNING COMMITTEE

#### 2ND NOVEMBER 2015 AT 6.00 P.M.

PRESENT: Councillors R. J. Deeming (Chairman), P.L. Thomas (Vice-Chairman),

C. Allen-Jones, S. J. Baxter, M. T. Buxton, M. Glass, C.A. Hotham,

K.J. May, S. R. Peters, S. P. Shannon and P. J. Whittaker

Officers: Mr D. Birch, Mr A. Fulford, Mrs H. Plant, Mr D. Kelly, Mrs S. Williams, Ms S. Price, Ms. E. Farmer, Mrs S. Sellers, Mrs C. Flanagan, Mr A. Novis (Worcestershire Highways Authority) and Ms R. Cole

#### 45/15 **APOLOGIES**

No apologies were received.

#### 46/15 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

The following declarations of interest were made:

Councillor C. A. Hotham declared that in relation to item 10 on the agenda (Planning Application 2015/0652 - Fiery Hill Road, Barnt Green) he had registered to speak against the application as Ward Member and had previously expressed objections to the application. Councillor Hotham therefore withdrew from the meeting prior to discussion of the item and took no part in discussion or voting on the matter.

Councillor P. L. Thomas declared an Other Disclosable Interest in Item 5 on the agenda (Planning Application 2015/0361 – Woodside Poultry Farm, Seafield Lane, Portway) in that he was acquainted with Mr Dean Attwell of Oakland International, the Applicant, but not to the extent that it would affect consideration of the application.

Councillor P. L. Thomas further declared an Other Disclosable Interest in item 7 on the agenda (Planning Application 2015/0357 – St Kenelm's Lodge, St Kenelm's Road, Romsley in that he had met the Applicant Mr W. Frazer.

Councillor P. L. Thomas asked for it to be noted that in relation to item 12 on the agenda (Planning Application 2015/0808 – 40 Marlborough Avenue, Bromsgrove) he had called the matter in for the Committee to consider but was not pre-determined and would be participating in the debate.

Councillor S. J. Baxter asked for it to be noted in relation to item 9 on the agenda (Planning Application 2015/0639 – 192, Alcester Road, Hollywood)

### Planning Committee 2nd November 2015

she had called the matter in for the Committee to consider but was not predetermined and would be participating in the debate. .

### 47/15 **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting of the Planning Committee held on 5th October 2015 were submitted.

**RESOLVED** that the minutes of the meeting be approved as a correct record.

48/15 2015/0361 - DEMOLITION OF EXISTING BUILDINGS TO ENABLE REDEVELOPMENT AS A B8 STORAGE AND DISTRIBUTION FACILITY WITH ASSOCIATED LANDSCAPING WORKS - WOODSIDE POULTRY FARM, SEAFIELD LANE, PORTWAY, REDDITCH, WORCESTERSHIRE B98 9DD - MR DEAN ATWELL

Members were reminded that this application had been deferred from the previous meeting of the Committee to enable further highways information to be obtained. Members had been provided with the full Transport Assessment and updated information (dated 16th October) submitted by the applicant. The Officers report had been updated and expanded to reflect all relevant circumstantial changes and additional submissions received since the previous meeting.

The Committee noted an update report on this application in regard to additional comments, received from Beoley Parish Council, an additional letter of objection and further correspondence from the applicant and their agents. The Committee noted the further comments of the Council's Highways Engineer following the receipt of the Trip Generation Technical Note from the applicant.

Members further noted the Officer response to the additional information received, all as detailed in the update report provided to Members of the Committee and the public gallery prior to the commencement of the meeting.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr J. Hoare, on behalf of the Applicant, and the Applicant Mr D. Attwell addressed the Committee. At the discretion of the Chairman each addressed the Committee for three minutes.

**RESOLVED** that planning permission be refused for the reasons set out on page 23 of the main agenda report.

(Councillor C.A. Allen-Jones took no part in the discussion or voting on this application due to his arrival after the start of the discussion.)

Following the conclusion of the above matter, the Chairman briefly adjourned the meeting to allow members of the public to vacate the public gallery.

## 49/15 <u>2014/1010 - REGULARISATION FOR CHANGE OF USE FROM AGRICULTURAL UNITS TO COMMERCIAL UNITS - TWIN OAKS, CURR LANE FARM, CURR LANE, UPPER BENTLEY, REDDITCH, WORCESTERSHIRE B97 5ST - CAFÉ QUOTE</u>

Officers referred to a Travel Plan submitted by the Applicants and to the response of the Highways Engineer to the Travel Plan.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mrs E. Mitchell, the Applicants Agent addressed the Committee.

The Committee then considered the application. Having considered the Officers report, Members were also concerned at the extent of the use of the land for storage purposes and the impact on the openness of the Green Belt.

**RESOLVED** that planning permission be refused for the reason set out on page 32 of the main agenda report and the following additional reason for refusal:

Due to the extent of the associated external storage the change of use has materially caused harm to the openness of the Green Belt. The proposal therefore does not fall within any of the categories of appropriate development specified at Policy DS2 of the Bromsgrove District Local Plan 2004 (BDLP) or at paragraphs 89 and 90 of the National Planning Policy Framework 2012 (NPPF). Thus the proposal constitutes an inappropriate form of development in the Green Belt which harms the Green Belt by reason of inappropriateness and harm to openness. No very special circumstances have been put forward or exist that would clearly outweigh the identified harm to the Green Belt. This is contrary to Policy DS2 of the BDLP and paragraphs 79,80,87,88,89 and 90 of the NPPF.

### 50/15 2015/0357 - REAR EXTENSION - ST. KENELMS LODGE, ST KENELMS ROAD, ROMSLEY, HALESOWEN, WORCESTERSHIRE B62 0NF - MR WILLIAM FRAZER

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mrs J. Frazer, the Applicant addressed the Committee.

**RESOLVED** that planning permission be refused for the reasons set out on pages 36 and 37 of the main agenda report.

### 51/15 <u>2015/0598 - REMOVAL OF WORKSHOP AND ERECTION OF BUNGALOW - 452 BIRMINGHAM ROAD, CATSHILL, WORCESTERSHIRE B61 OHR - MR RICHARD DE SOUSA</u>

At the invitation of the Chairman, Mr Trueman, objecting, addressed the Committee. Mrs N. De Sousa, the Applicant also addressed the Committee. Councillor B. T. Cooper, in whose Ward the application site is located, also addressed the Committee.

### Planning Committee 2nd November 2015

Members then considered the Application, which was recommended for refusal by Officers. Having considered all of the information provided Members were of the view that the proposed development was acceptable in that it would make beneficial use of previously developed land, in view of the existing appearance of the site, and the potential further use of the site as a workshop within a residential area.

**RESOLVED** that planning permission be granted, subject to the following Conditions:

- 1) Usual construction conditions;
- 2) Removal of permitted development rights relating to extensions; and
- 3) Landscaping conditions to include the requirement for suitable fencing in the rear garden.

# 52/15 2015/0639 - CONSTRUCTION OF NEW 418 SQM TAPE PRINT FACILITY, EXTENSION OF SERVICE YARD AREA, ACCESS TRACK TO ADJACENT FIELD AND DEMOLITION OF 534 SQM OF EXISTING REDUNDANT OUTBUILDINGS - 192 ALCESTER ROAD, HOLLYWOOD, BIRMINGHAM, WORCESTERSHIRE B47 5HH - MR JAMES KILBY

Officers referred to the objections to the application received from Wythall Parish Council, as detailed in the update report provided for the Committee Members and the public gallery prior to the commencement of the meeting.

Officers also referred to the receipt of amended plans indicating a revised siting of the proposed building received on 2nd November 2015 and these were displayed as part of the officer presentation.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Ms S. Gough, a close neighbour to the site, addressed the Committee in objection. Mr J. Kilby, the Applicant also addressed the Committee.

Members were of the view that there should be an additional condition to ensure that the main door was kept shut except when it was required for access.

**RESOLVED** that Planning Permission be granted, subject to the Conditions and Informatives set out on pages 49 and 50 of the main agenda report and the following additional condition:

The main door to be kept closed except when required for access to the building.

### 53/15 <u>2015/0652 - REALIGNMENT OF FIERY HILL ROAD - FIERY HILL ROAD,</u> BARNT GREEN, BIRMINGHAM, WORCESTERSHIRE B45 8LF - MR MARK GAY

The Committee noted the additional information on relevant planning history contained in the update report. In addition the update report contained the comments of the Landscape and Tree Officer together with an additional condition and notes requested by Network Rail.

At the invitation of the Chairman Ms I. Curtis, Chairman of the Barnt Green Residents' Association addressed the Committee objecting to the application. Mr R. Bellamy, on behalf of the applicants also addressed the Committee. Mrs S. Whitehand from Barnt Green Parish Council also addressed the Committee. Councillor C. A. Hotham, in whose ward the application was located, also addressed the Committee.

Information was provided to the Committee by the speakers in relation to the traffic survey which had been undertaken in respect of the application. In particular there was concern regarding the timing of the survey and the average traffic speed recorded. The Highways Engineer was unable to comment in detail on the data at the Meeting.

**RESOLVED** that this matter be deferred to enable further discussions to take place with the Highway Authority and the Applicant with regard to the traffic survey undertaken.

54/15

2015/0703 - CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW 50 BEDROOM DEMENTIA
CARE HOME, WITH COMMUNAL FACILITIES, ANCILLARY AREAS,
LANDSCAPING AND PARKING (APPROVAL OF RESERVE MATTERS)
- THE UPLANDS/BURCOT GRANGE, 33 GREENHILL, BURCOT,
BROMSGROVE, WORCESTERSHIRE B60 1BL - MR KENNETH
MACKENZIE

**RESOLVED** that approval of reserved matters be granted subject to the receipt of satisfactory views of the Landscape and Tree Officer.

### 55/15 <u>2015/0808 - REPLACEMENT DWELLING - 40 MARLBOROUGH</u> <u>AVENUE, BROMSGROVE, WORCESTERSHIRE, B60 2PD - MR MIKE</u> <u>LEWIS</u>

Officers reported on the receipt of six further letters of objection together with twelve letters of support. The Highways Engineer had no objection to the application.

At the invitation of the Chairman, Ms A. Pickup, a close neighbour to the application site, addressed the Committee in objection. Mr M. Lewis, the Applicant also addressed the Committee.

The Committee then considered the Application which Officers had recommended for approval. Having considered the report and the representations made Members were of the opinion that the proposal as

### Planning Committee 2nd November 2015

shown would be out of keeping with the street scene because of the bulk of the side elevation arising from the proposed balcony and the lack of a hipped roof.

**RESOLVED**: that Planning Permission be refused for the following reason:

The bulk and mass of the side wall elevation and the lack of a hipped roof would result in a configuration which is out of keeping with the existing street scene.

The meeting closed at 9.00 p.m.

Chairman